

## CASE STUDY

## EVALUATING NONTRADITIONAL INCENTIVE SYSTEMS: HOWE 2 SKI STORES

The Howe 2 Ski Stores are a chain of three ski and windsurfing shops located in the suburbs of a large eastern city. Maria Howe, a ski enthusiast and business school major, opened a store 10 years ago after her college graduation with financial backing from her family and several friends. From its inception, the Howe 2 store was intended to provide state of the art equipment and clothing for skiers at all skill levels, from beginner to champion. It was to be staffed by employees who were themselves advanced skiers and could provide expert advice on the choice of clothing and equipment, and it was intended to have a quick response time that would permit the last-minute purchase of equipment and clothing prior to a ski trip.

Howe originally drew from a pool of skiing friends and fellow students to staff the stores and still prefers to hire part-time employees with skiing expertise who might leave in a year over more stable, full-time employees with less expertise and interest in the sport. Whether administrative staff, cashiers, clerks, or molders (employees who fit bindings to skis), employees were encouraged to keep up on the latest skiing equipment and trends, attend ski vendor shows, try out demo equipment, and give feedback on the store's inventory in order to help provide the highest-quality, state-of-the-art equipment and advice for the customer. Suggestion boxes were placed in the store and Howe herself regularly collected, read, and acted upon the suggestions made by the clerks and customers. She developed special advertising campaigns to build an image for the nearby slopes in order to increase the market. As the business grew, Howe even added a line of rental equipment in order to lower the costs and encourage people to try the sport.

Although profits grew irregularly due to weather effects and the faddish nature of the sport, Howe's efforts paid off in the long term, and within four years business had grown sufficiently to permit the opening of a second Howe 2 Ski Store in another suburb about 10 miles from the first. In order to even out sales across the year, about six

years ago Howe took a chance on the growing windsurfing market and the East Coast location and added a line of equipment for this sport. The move turned out to be a very good one. The windsurfing market increased by more than 300% in four years and continues to experience a slower but stable pattern of growth as families and older adults attempt the sport. This market has enabled her to smooth out the number of sales occurring throughout the year.

Three years ago, Howe was able to open a third store, located within a 15-mile radius from the other two. Although managers have been hired to run each of the stores and the total number of employees has grown to 65, Howe's basic strategy has remained the same—high-quality, state-of-the-art products, a knowledgeable staff, and quick response time. Profits from the stores have continued to grow, although at a slower rate. Competition from other ski stores has also increased noticeably within the last two years.

The threat of increased competition has been exacerbated by signs that employee productivity has begun to slide. Last year, there were eight occasions where expensive ski orders were not delivered in time for the customer's ski vacation. Although Howe used a variety of maneuvers to retain the customers' patronage (e.g., paying for the customers to rent equipment of equivalent quality, expressing the equipment to the customer as soon as it was delivered, and lowering the price of the equipment), the costs of these late orders were high. She realizes that word of these kinds of incidents could significantly damage the store's reputation. Furthermore, at least 15% of all ski orders were more than two days late, even though customers did not miss a trip or vacation as a result.

In an attempt to respond to these difficulties, Howe instituted a merit performance system for the molders (employees who fit the binding to skis). Although productivity seemed to increase for awhile, waves of discontent popped out all over the stores. The molders felt that their merit ratings were inaccurate because the store managers could

not observe them much of the time. Further, they argued that their performance would have been much higher had not other employees interrupted them with questions about appropriate bindings or failed to clearly identify the appropriate equipment on the sales tickets. Other employees also complained because they were not given the opportunity for merit pay. The buyers, who visit ski shows, examine catalogs, and talk with sales representatives in order to decide on the inventory, argued that their work was essential for high sales figures and quality equipment. Sales clerks claimed that their in-depth familiarity with an extensive inventory and their sales skills were essential to increasing sales. They also noted their important role in negotiating a delivery date that the molders could meet. Similar arguments were made by the people in the credit office who arranged for short-term financing if necessary, and by the cashiers who verified costs and checked credit card approvals. Even the stockers noted that the store would be in a bad way if they did not locate the correct equipment in a warehouse full of inventory and deliver it in a timely manner to the molders.

Howe had to concede that the employees were correct on many of these points, so she suspended the merit plan at the end of the ski season and

promised to reevaluate its fairness. Even more convincing were several indications that production problems were not limited to molder employees. Complaints about customer service increased during the year. Several customers noted that they were allowed to stand, merchandise in hand, waiting for a clerk to help them, while clerks engaged in deep conversations among themselves. Although Howe mentioned this to employees at the stores when she visited and asked the store managers to discuss it in staff meetings, the complaints continued. A record number of "as is" items were sold at the end of the season sale because they were damaged in the warehouse, the store, or the molders. The closing inventory revealed that 20% of the rental equipment had been lost or seriously damaged without resulting charges to renters because records were poorly maintained. Regular checks of the suggestion boxes in the store revealed fewer and fewer comments. Although extreme, similar problems occurred in windsurfing season. Employees just didn't seem to notice the problems or, worse, didn't seem to care.

Source: S. M. Nkomo, M. D. Fottler, and R. B. McAfee, *Applications of Human Resource Management: Cases, Exercises, and Skill Builders* (Mason, OH: South-Western, 2005). Reprinted with permission.

## ENDNOTES

1 S. Bates, "Top Pay for Best Performance," *HR Magazine* (January 2003): 32-36. For recent research on how the change orientation of a firm's strategy is related to the use of incentives, see B. K. Boyd and A. Salamin, "Strategic Reward Systems: A Contingency Model of Pay System Design," *Strategic Management Journal* 22 (2001): 777-792.

2 Results of this survey as reported in "No Real Money on the Table," *Workforce Management* (December 2003): 115. For more details, visit <http://www.watsonwyatt.com>.

3 N. Byrnes, "Avon Calling—Lots of New Reps," *Business Week* (June 2, 2003): 53-54.

4 G. D. Jenkins Jr., A. Mitra, N. Gupta, and J. D. Shaw, "Are Financial Incentives Related to Performance? A Meta-Analytic Review of Empirical Research," *Journal of Applied Psychology* 83(5) (1998): 777-787; J. S. Kane and K. A. Freeman, "A Theory of Equitable Performance Standards," *Journal of Management* 23(1) (1997): 37-58.

5 N. Byrnes, "Avon Calling—Lots of New Reps," *Business Week* (June 2, 2003): 53-54.

6 P. Digh, "The Next Challenge: Holding People Accountable," *HR Magazine: Diversity Agenda* (October 1998): 63-69; S. N. Mehta, "Diversity Pays," *Wall Street Journal* (April 11, 1996): R12.

7 Hay Group, *A Comparison of Top Executive Compensation Practices: Examining the Gaps and Similarities among European and US Companies* (New York: Hay Group, 2003); for an excellent brief historical summary see G. T. Milkovich and J. Stevens, "From Pay to Rewards: 100 Year Change," *ACA Journal* (First Quarter 2000): 6-18.

8 E. Krell, "Getting a Grip on Executive Compensation," *Workforce* (February 2003): 30-34; "Executive Compensation: Recent Trends, Changes and Highlights," <http://www.workforce.com/archive/article/45/11.php>, June 24, 2003.

9 J. Wiscombe, "Rewards Get Results," *Workforce* (April 2002): 42.

10 K. A. Brown and V. L. Huber, "Lowering Floors and Raising Ceilings: A Longitudinal Assessment of the Effects of an Earnings-at-Risk Plan on Pay Satisfaction," *Personnel Psychology* 45 (June 1992): 279-311.

11 R. D. Banker, S-Y Lee, G. Potter, and D. Srinivasan, "Contextual Analysis of Performance Impacts of Outcome-Based Incentive Compensation," *Academy of Management Journal* 39 (1996): 920-941.

12 J. R. Deckop, R. Mangel, and C. Cirka, "Getting More than You Deserve: Organizational Citizenship Behavior and Pay-for-Performance Plans," *Academy of Management Journal* 41 (1999): 420-428; G. D. Jenkins Jr., A. Mitra, N. Gupta, and J. D. Shaw, "Are Financial Incentives Related to Performance? A Meta-Analytic Review of Empirical Research," *Journal of Applied Psychology* 83(5) (1998): 777-787.