|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Zero points in any category: the required element does not exist in the brief or oral argument summary or is unrecognizable in the brief** | Beginning | Developing | Accomplished | Exemplary |

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Case name and case citation (5%) (maximum 5 points on a 100 point scale)** | **2 points:** The Opinion **cannot be accurately identified** based on the information given and/**or the parties’ role in the litigation cannot be discerned**. | **3 points:** The Opinion can be located based on the information provided and the court which rendered it can be discerned, but **elements of the case name and/or citation are missing**. | **4 points:** **Case name is present and parties are identified**; citation to the case is given; **jurisdiction is evident; errors are minimal**. | **5 points:** Case name is correctly stated and parties correctly identified by name and by their role in the litigation; citation to the case itself is **complete and accurate and comports with Bluebook format** |
| **Facts (10%) (maximum 10 points on a 100 point scale)** | **6 points:** Factual statement is **incomplete or erroneous**, rendering **the brief unusable** to the reader, at least in part | **7 points:** Important facts **are missing and/or unnecessary detail is included**; reader is **confused by the presentation** | **8 points: Most key/relevant facts are provided**; irrelevant facts are omitted; statement of facts is **understandable** to the reader | **10 points: All key/relevant facts are provided**; additional facts provided only as necessary for the reader to understand the decision and the court’s analysis; facts are presented clearly and **concisely and without error or confusion** |
| **Procedural Posture (10%) (maximum 10 points on a 100 point scale)** | **6 points:** Procedural history **does not enable the reader to understand** the history of the case and/or how it arrived in this court | **7 points: Gaps** in the history of the case or errors in case sequence or case events exist | **8 points:** The history of the case (where it started and how it came to this court) is presented with **minimal errors** in sequence or process | **10 points: All essential information** concerning the history of the case (origin, sequence of case events in various courts, and current posture) is included; courts’ names, jurisdictions, and actions are provided and are accurate. |
| **Issue (10%) (maximum 10 points on a 100 point scale)** | **6 points:** The legal issue is **incorrectly stated** | **7 points:** The legal issue is identified as a **general topic and/or is stated in an overly broad manner**; precision is lacking | **8 points:** The legal question is presented accurately, but **lacking in precision and/or is not framed as a question** | **10 points:** The legal question or questions before this court are **correctly and succinctly stated** and the Issue if framed in terms of a question |
| **Holding (5%) (maximum 5 points on a 100 point scale)** | **2 points:** The court’s resolution of the legal issue is **incorrectly presented and/or the Holding of a different court is presented**, thus presenting an **inaccurate picture** of this court’s decision | **3 points:** The court’s resolution of the legal issue is **overly broad or is inaccurate** in some regard | **4 points:** The court’s resolution of the legal issue is **accurate but is lacking in precision** | **5 points:** The court’s resolution of the legal issue is **correctly and succinctly stated** and is not confused with the Judgment or procedural disposition of the case; Issue and Holding “match” |
| **Judgment /Disposition(5%) (maximum 5 points on a 100 point scale)** | **2 points:** The disposition of the case is **erroneously presented** | **3 points:** The disposition of the case can be **discerned but is unclear** to the reader | **4 points:** The disposition of the case is **accurately stated, but lacks precision** | **5 points:** The disposition of the case and the relief, in any, granted by the court is **accurately and clearly stated** |
| **Rationale/Analysis (25%) (maximum 25 points on a 100 point scale) This is applied to both the brief and the oral argument summary** | **10 points:** The court’s reasoning is **erroneously presented, thereby misleading** the reader. It was not apparent from the oral argument paper that the student listened to the argument. | **15 points:** The court’s reasoning is presented in only **general terms which are not instructive** to the reader. The oral argument position paper was a short summary with no analysis. | **20 points:** The court’s reasoning and rationale are **accurately presented; some analytical detail may be missing, but there are no errors**. The oral argument paper was adequate but showed no detailed analysis | **25 points:** The court’s reasoning, analysis, and rationale are presented in a **complete, succinct, and understandable** manner. All relevant considerations are included.  The oral argument position paper is informative and demonstrates the students listened to the full argument |

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Dissent/Comments/**  **Significance/Impact (10%) (maximum 10 points on a 100 point scale)** | **6 points:** The student **failed to present necessary information** about a Dissent or about the significance of the case **or presented same in an inaccurate or misleading manner.** | **7 points:** The student noted a Dissent and/or the significance of the case but **described same in an unclear manner**. | **8 points:** The student correctly **noted the existence of a Dissenting opinion, if any, and accurately described it**; information/comments, if any, relate to the opinion in a logical manner. | **10 points:** The student made a **correct decision** concerning whether there is additional information or commentary which should be conveyed to the reader, including information about a Dissenting opinion; the information is **conveyed in a clear and accurate manner**. Impact on society, if any, is conveyed. |
| **Writing Standards**  **(10%)(maximum 10 points on a 100 points scale) This is applied to both the brief and oral argument summary** | **6 points:** Paper contains **numerous grammatical, punctuation, and spelling errors.** Language uses jargon or conversational tone**; OR brief fails to use Headings**. | **7 points:** Paper contains **several grammatical, punctuation, and/or spelling errors. Language lacks clarity** or includes some use of jargon and /or conversational tone**. Some headings are missing** or fail to correspond to the required elements of the case brief. | **8 points:** Student demonstrates consistent and correct use of the rules of grammar usage, punctuation and spelling, **with a few minor errors**. **Headings are used and** correspond to the required elements of the case brief. | **10 points:** Student demonstrates **consistent and correct use of the rules of grammar usage, punctuation, and spelling. Language is clear and precise**. Sentences display consistently strong, varied structure. **Headings are used** and correspond to the required elements of the case brief. |
| **Citation of Sources**  **(10%)(maximum 10 points on a 100 point scale)** | **6 points:** Citations of reference sources exist; citations apparently correspond to the correct source **but do not enable the reader to locate the source. Bluebook format lacking.** | **7 points: Attempts to cite reference sources are made**, but the reader has difficulty finding the sources; attempts to use Bluebook format are evident but **poorly executed**. | **8 points:** Reference sources and the text of the Opinion itself **are cited as necessary, but some components of the citations are missing** and/**or Bluebook format is faulty**. | **10 points:** Reference sources used by the student, including the text of the Opinion itself, **are cited appropriately and accurately. No writing of others is left without quotation and/or attribution**, as appropriate. **Bluebook format is used correctly** and consistently. |